



RAJASTHAN GRAMEEN AAJEEVIKA VIKAS PARISHAD, JAIPUR

MIS DATA VALIDATION SURVEY REPORT (ON THE BASIS OF SAMPLE SURVEY CONDUCTED IN JUNE, 2016)

Objective of Study

RAJEEVIKA is indented to capture all information of project interventions in MIS for effective monitoring and dissemination of data in public domain. Since all MIS reports are accessible in public domain, data entered on MIS must be true and not be misleading. To know the validity of MIS data, a sample survey was conducted in 24 resource, intensive and partnership blocks. In this survey master & transaction data of SHGs, VOs & CLFs, community cadre profiles and their payments were verified from the field.

Sample

One village was randomly selected from each cluster of 24 blocks and data of 10 oldest SHGs, 1 VO and all community cadre of that village were verified during the survey. In case of villages having less than 10 SHGs, all SHGs were verified. CLF information were also verified, where CLFs have been formed. On the basis of this criteria 708 SHGs, 68 VOs, 40 CLFs, 448 BKs, 58 VOAs and 195 Community Cadre were under study.

Findings

SHG Data: Survey data reveals that 67.8% entries of sample SHGs were true whereas 22.9% entries were false and 9.4% entries were not entered in MIS. Following table shows that mostly SHG member's details and transaction data entries were entered false or not entered. Total 24.8 % SHG member's details and 39.1% transaction data entries were found false. 19.2% member's entries and 14.5% transaction entries were not entered in MIS.

SHG Entries	% Entries		
	False	True	Not Entered
SHG Details	12.5	85.8	1.7
Members/OBs Details	24.8	56.0	19.2
CIF Details	15.1	82.8	2.1
Transaction Entries	39.1	46.4	14.5
All entries	22.9	67.8	9.4

In SHG details section, mostly date of formation, meeting day, regular saving per member per meeting, date of account opening, active women & book keeper details entries were found false or not entered.

In SHG members/OBs section, mostly BPL/APL, leadership & education status entries were false whereas aadhar no., SECC No. & mobile numbers entries were not entered in MIS.

In CIF details section, dates of T1 & T2 received were found false and in transaction entries, all indicators were found false or not entered on equal stage.

VO Data: Study reveals that only 60% entries of sample VOs were true whereas 40% entries were false or not entered in MIS. Following table shows that mostly VO member's details and transaction data entries were entered false or not entered. Total 36.5% VO member's details and 58.7% VO transaction data entries were false. 11.3% VO Member's entries and 7.3% CIF entries were not entered on MIS.

VO Entries	% Entries		
	False	True	Not Entered
VO Details	11.5	82.8	5.7
Members/OBs Details	36.5	52.3	11.3
CIF Details	26.9	65.8	7.3
Transaction Entries	58.7	40.2	1.1
All Entries	33.4	60.2	6.4

In VO details section, mostly date of formation, meeting day, date of account opening, account numbers, VOA details entries were found false or not entered.

In VO members/OBs section Office Bearers, number of members & member's name entries were false or not entered in MIS.

In CIF details section, total amount of T2 received, no. of SHGs received T2 and date of VO stratup fund received were found false and in transaction entry section, all indicators were found false or not entered on equal stage.

CLF Data: Study reveals that 65% entries of sample CLFs were true whereas 35% entries were false or not entered in MIS. Following table shows that CLF member's/OBs details & transaction data entries were entered false or not entered on equal stage. Total 23.2 % CLF member's details and 20.7% CLF transaction data entries were false. 14.4% CIF details and 45.1% transaction entries were not entered in MIS.

CLF Entries	% Entries		
	False	True	Not Entered
CLF Details	10.0	82.8	7.2
Members/OBs Details	23.2	72.3	4.5
CIF Details	14.4	71.2	14.4
Transaction Entries	20.7	34.3	45.1
All Entries	17.1	65.1	17.8

In CLF details section, mostly date of formation, registration details, date of account opening, accountant name entries were found false or not entered.

In CLF members/OBs section, number of members & office bearer details were false or not entered in MIS.

In CIF details section, mostly dates of CLF fund received were found false and in transaction entry section, all indicators were found false or not entered on equal stage.

Community Cadre Data: Survey data shows that only 65.6% entries of SHG book keepers were true whereas 34.4% entries were false or not entered in MIS. Similarly only 56.9% VOA details were true whereas 43.1% entries were false or not entered in MIS.

Record Keepers Entries	% Entries		
	False	True	Not Entered
SHG BK Details	13.3	65.6	21.1
VO Assistant Details	15.2	56.9	27.9

After block-wise analysis, it was found that more than 40% entries were entered false in Simalwara, Anandpuri, Dungarpur and Kekari blocks. More than 10% entries not done in Pipalkhunt, Balesar, Sekhala & Aklera blocks. More than 75% SHG entries were found true in Churu, Dausa, Pindwara & Ghari blocks.

MBK Status: Transaction data entry largely depends upon accuracy in CBO's record keeping and accuracy in record keeping totally depends upon the capacity/understanding level of SHG BKs and VOAs. Since, Master book keepers are responsible for capacity/understanding level building of SHG BKs and VOAs, therefore 3 questions about MBKs were asked to SHG BKs and VOAs during the survey. The following table reveals that 83.7% BKs told that MBKs were placed in their area. But, 72.7% of BKs (where MBKs were placed) told that they are being facilitated by their MBKs and 27.3% BKs told that they are not being facilitated by MBKs.

According to 78.6% BKs (where MBKs were placed), MPRs being collected by their MBKs. 21.4 BKs told that MPRs not being collected by their MBKs.

MBK Status responded by SHG BKs / VOAs	% BKs / VOAs	
	No	Yes
Whether_MBK_Placed	16.3	83.7
Facilitated_by_MBK_if_placed	27.3	72.7
MPR_collected_by_MBK_if_placed	21.4	78.6

On the basis of above 3 MBK indicators, it can be shown that MBK policy is working in only 60% sample area and rest of the 40% sample area is not being facilitated by MBKs.

195 Cadre other than BKs and VOAs which deployed in sample area were also validated during the survey. Total 81 AWs, 25 MCLP cadre, 22 RCRPs, 18 CBKs, 27 MBKs, 10 RBKs, 5 VO CRPs, 3 KVS and 4 bank sakhis were interviewed about their details and status of payments.

Data shows that only 67.5% entries of community cadre were true whereas 7.5% entries were false and 25% entries were not entered in MIS.

Cadre Payments: Cadre was also asked about status of their payments. It is found that 87.1% cadre was getting honorarium whereas 12.9% cadre was not getting. Further, out of 87.1% cadre was getting honorarium, 82.7% was getting as per bills/reports submitted by them and 17.3% was not getting as per thier reports submitted.

Cadre	Yes	No
Receiving Honorarium	87.1	12.9
Payment Received As Per Bill/Reports Submitted	82.7	17.3

The following data reveals that 49.5% cadre got their honorarium timely. But 1 month honorarium was pending according to 28.8% cadre and 2 or more month's honorarium was pending according to 21.7% cadre.

Pending Honorarium	
Period	Percent
No Pendency	49.5
1 Month	28.8
2 Month	9.0
3 Month	6.3
4 Month	4.5
5 Month	1.8

After block-wise analysis, it was found that more than 25% cadre was placed but not getting honorarium in Anandpuri, Kherwara and Kolayat blocks whereas 100% cadre was receiving honorarium in Dausa, Balesar, Shekhala, Pindwara, Kekari, Ashind, Devgarh, Jhadol, Ghari and Bakani blocks.

Further, 50% or more cadre was not getting honorarium timely in Kolayat, Kherwara, Anandpuri, bakani and Ghari blocks whereas 100% cadre was getting honorarium timely in Dausa, Balesar, Pindwara, Pali, Kekari, Ashind, Devgarh, Jhadol, Bengu, Sangod and Pipalkhunt blocks.

Other Findings

Pen picture of block in view of survey objectives was also asked to each enumerator. Some major findings mentioned by enumerators are as follows:

Block - Pipalkhunt:

“एज्यूकेशन डिटेल् अधिकतर एस.एच.जी में अपडेट नहीं है। आधारकार्ड एवं मोबाईल नंबर किसी भी एस.एच.जी. का अपडेट नहीं है। एस.एच.जी. के तलपट अधिकतर राशि एमआईएस से नहीं मील रही है।

बुककीपर की ट्रेनिंग नहीं हो पाई हैं जिससे बुककीपर को रिकॉर्ड लिखने में परेशानी आ रही है एवं बुककीपर को पूर्ण रूप से सही एवं पूर्ण एमपीआर सही तरिके से भरना नहीं आ रहा है”

Block- Garhi:

“In garhi block there is no MBK Cadre have been deployed whereas the number of SHG is more and due to this PRP have to do this extra job of data porting of MPR.

There in maximum SHG's all members shows BPL on MIS whereas maximum of them is APL. SHG in field not Graded by VO but grading is showing on MIS of all SHGs.”

Block- Devgarh:

कलस्टर मे दो मास्टर बुक कियर थे जिसमें से मास्टर बुक कियर द्वारा MPR ठीक बनाये जा रहे है। परन्तु आज दिनांक तक मास्टर बुक कियर को Data Portar Policy के अनुसार कोई भी मानदेय नहीं दिया गया है।

बैंक सखी रेमा बाई का मानदेय फपवरी से मई माह तक का नहीं दिया गया है। गाँव म दो MBK थे (खेमराज)जिसमें से दोनो MBK कार्य संतोशपूर्वक मिला । परन्तु MBK को दिसम्बर 2015 के बाद कोई मानदेय नहीं दिया गया है। बुक कियरो के प्रिक्षण की भी बहुत जरूरत है।

स्वयं सहायता समूह का रिकॉर्ड ठीक स्थिति में था परन्तु 6 स्वयं सहायता समूह का रिकॉर्ड स प्राप्त नहीं हुआ एवं स्वयं सहायता समूह महिलाओ एवं MBK व PFT द्वारा वार्तालाप के दौरान पाया गया कि 6 स्वयं सहायता समूह का रिकॉर्ड ICDS की कर्मचारी (आ गा देवी) द्वारा जब्त किये हुए है। वह एक बार महिने में आती है एवं मिटिंग करके

रिकॉर्डस साथ में ही ले जाती है। जबकि इन स्वयं सहायता समूह को ट्रेच 1 ट्रेच 2 भी प्राप्त हो चुका है। एच इन स्वयं सहायता समूह का रिकॉर्ड भी पिछले छः महिनो सं PAS पर Update नहीं है। MBK(प्रहलाद साल्वी) मिला जिसका कार्य संतोशपूर्वक मिला परन्तु जनवरी के बाद कोई मानदेय नहीं मिला ।

Block- Anandpuri:

-दिसम्बर 2015 रिकॉर्ड नहीं लिखा हुआ जबकि माशिक प्रतिवेदन अप्रैल -2016 हुआ 6 माह से समूह का रिकॉर्ड नहीं लिखा गया | को बुक कीपर () द्वारा ₹ 2500 ₹ . () जिसका कोई रिकॉर्ड नहीं है | समूह के पास बैंक डायरी नहीं , बैंक की महिलाओ को जानकारी नहीं है |
CBK- राम द्वारा अन्य समूहों से भी पैसे लेना का पता लगा हे महिलाओ से पूछने पर जानकारी मिली | दोलत राम द्वारा मं का पता लगा हे महिलाओ ने बताया की जब समूह को 15000 , 110000 , बैंक से | केज हुआ 16000 ₹ (15000 – 1000 Rs ,,110000—10000 rs., bank linkage –5000 Rs.) द्वारा रिकॉर्ड नि हे रप कॉपी में लिखे हुए मिले (ने लिखे हुए दिखा) और उसके द्वारा पैसे जमा भी नि करवाए गए |

समूह गाव में हे ही नहीं इस र में बजरंग बली समूह की महिलाओ का नाम जो: मिला ही नहीं जबकि समूह को RF, CIF दोनों मिला हुआ हे |

1. MBK समूहों के पास नहीं जाते , माशिक प्रतिवेदन बना कर राजीविका mis पर दर्ज करवा रहे हे |
2. जो समूह बंद हे या जिनके रिकॉर्ड नहीं लिखे हुए हे उनके MPR अप्रैल तक चढ़ रखे हे |
3. 1 गणेश समूह गाव में हे ही नहीं और उनको 15000 पर 110000 रु मिले हे |
4. कीपर की ट्रेनिंग भी नहीं हे रही हे | कीपर र रिकॉर्ड लिखने में ब रही र रिकॉर्ड भी सही सही नहीं हे |
5. विका mis समूहों र में RF, CIF की entry नहीं हे |
6. बैंक प नहीं मिली |
7. 3 RCRP 1 CBK मिछला र निमिला हे |
8. CLF फण्ड 2 हिस्सों में CLF दिया गया हे प्रथम 150000 दितीय 200000 |
9. ग्राम र VRF दिया र परन्तु राजीविका MIS दर्ज नहीं मिले |
10. कीपर की जानकारी र नहीं मिली , बुक कीपर परिवर्तित. हो र स्थान कीपर र राजीविका mis दर्ज र नहीं किया हे |

Block- Asind:

एक समूह जो की राजीविका एमआईएस पर एक्टिव है वा असल मे बन्द हो चुका है वहा कायरत मास्टर बुक कीपर को इसकी जानकारी तक नहीं थी जब मै वहा गया तब ये बात उस एमबीके को पता चली एव उस समूह को दोबारा जोडने का कोई प्रयास भी नहीं किया ।

समूह की भी बैंक पासबुक अपडेट नहीं थी एक समूह श्रीराम जिसे टी-1 नहीं मिला है लेकिन राजीविका एमआईएस पर उसे टी 1 मिला दिखा रखा है कप्युनिटी केडर का वेतन समय पर मिला रहा है | ग्राम सगठन का भी डाटा गलत इन्द्राज है

Block- Balesar:

They had 768 SHGs and 124 are defunct according to MIS but the number of defunct SHGs is more than the given numbers.

Last MIS person Mr Ramesh (from Govt department) enter lots of false entries like SHG member name (AAA, BBB, XXX) their Tranche- 1 data Tranche- 2 data and no updating in cadre profile.

It is found that there is only one computer operator who had joined the same day as I visited the place who was supposed to do all the work. There are many mistakes found in physical data and MIS data. Like no member profile updating of no cadre profile updating. No maintenance of records in any physical formats.

Block- Niwai:

1. एम.बी.के. गांव मे जाते है पर बी.के. को एम.पी.आर बनाने में प्रशिक्षण की आवश्यकता है।
2. कुछ बन्द समुह रिवाइव हुए है इसकी जानकारी पी.फ.टी. को नहीं है।
3. बहकवा मे कुछ समूहो मे हैंडहोल्डिंग की कमी के कारण समूह बन्द हो रही है।
4. बारेडा मे एम.बी.के. को ही रिकोर्ड लिखना नहीं आता इस कारण बी.के. को प्रशिक्षण नहीं मिल रहा है उन्हे रिकोर्ड लिखने मे परेशानी आ रही है।
5. राजिवीका एम.आई.एस. पर समूहो के तलपट तो अप्रैल 2016 तक की एंट्री है एम.आई.एस. पर डाटा गलत है लेकिन समूह के रिकोर्ड सही लिखे जा रहे है।
6. समूह के सदस्यो की जानकारी एम.आई.एस. पर अपडेट नहीं है

Block- Churu:

1. MBKs are good Work
2. Vo & CLF is good Performance in MIS Transaction Entry
3. CBK is Not Working
4. Cader Payment issue is not this block.
5. Defunct Record is not found.

Block- Pindwara:

अधिकतर समूहों की बैंक पास बुक अपडेट नहीं पाई गई। गांव में दो सक्रिय महिलाएँ कार्य कर रही है लेकिन एमआईएस पर एक ही इन्द्राज की गई है एवं खेरु बानो सक्रिय महिला को फरवरी माह तक का ही मानदेय प्राप्त हुआ है। ग्राम संगठन का रिकॉर्ड पीएफटी एवं पीआरपी के निवास पर पाया गया

- पिण्डावाडा ब्लॉक में मास्टर बुक कीपर द्वारा सक्रिय रूप से कार्य नहीं किया जा रहा है।
- पीएफटी एवं पीआरपी द्वारा ग्राम संगठन व समूहों की बैठक विजीट नहीं की जाती है जिससे समूहों के डिफंक्ट होने की स्थिति पैदा हो रही है।
- ग्राम संगठनों को स्टार्ट फण्ड दिये जाने के बावजूद भी वीओ कार्यालय स्थापित नहीं किये गये है।
- बुक कीपर को केवल सीआरपी के द्वारा ही प्रशिक्षण दिया गया है, उसके उपरान्त बुक कीपर को प्रशिक्षण प्राप्त नहीं हुआ है।
- ग्राम संगठन एवं समूह में मासिक प्रतिवेदन की प्रति नहीं रखी जाती है।
- अधिकतम ग्राम संगठन एवं समूहों के रिकॉर्ड पीएफटी एवं पीआरपी द्वारा लिखे जा रहे है।

- सक्रिय महिला द्वारा गांव में छुटे हुए गरीब परिवारों को समूहों से जोडा नहीं जा रहा है एवं ना ही नये समूहों का गठन कर उन्हें लाभान्वित किया गया है ।

Conclusions

On the basis of above findings, it can be concluded that –

- 65% data entries found true in MIS. 20% entries found false and 15% entries were not entered in MIS. Mostly, transaction data entries and member's profiles found false or not entered.
- Master data like member's details & CIF details are not being updated after feeding once.
- In spite of MBKs placed in 83.7% area, capacity of book keepers is a major concern. Due to this reason, transaction data is not being prepared properly and false enties are being done in MIS.
- MBKs are getting timely honorarium in Kekari, Balesar & Pipalkhunt blocks but mostly false entries and incomplete entries found in these blocks.
- Alarming issues like fake entries of CIF, cadre not receiving payments, corruption in releasing CIF are found in anandpuri block.
- MBK policy is being implemented in only 60% of survey area and regular monitoring of MBKs at block level is not being done.
- 2-5 month's honorarium was pending according to 21.7% cadre in Kolayat, Kherwara, Anandpuri, bakani and Ghari blocks.

Recommendations

It is recommended that –

- All MBKs deployed in these blocks should be screened and trained at state level.
- Regular monitoring of MBKs at block level is highly expected. MBKs should be paid as per MBK policy and they should aware about their rolls and responsibilities. Non performer MBKs should be removed.
- Book keepers trainings should be monitored by BPMs/DPMs
- Master data of SHG/VO/CLF/Cadre should be updated once in a month.

- CBOs audit process should be expedited in these blocks so that transaction data entry can be corrected.
 - CBOs bank passbooks should be updated at least once in a month.
 - Timely honorarium to each cadre should be ensured by concerning BPM.
 - More than 40% entries were entered false in Simalwara, Anandpuri, Dungarpur and Kekari blocks. Remedial action is highly expected in these blocks.
 - More than 25% cadre placed but not getting honorarium in Anandpuri, Kherwara and Kolayat blocks as well as 50% or more cadre not getting honorarium timely in these blocks. Cadre payment review is highly expected in these blocks.
 - Since alarming issues observed in Anandpuri block, hence block must be screened as earliest as possible.
-